Tour Guides to the Ineffable

BY JAN LISA HUTTNER — SPECIAL TO THE WORLD JEWISH DIGEST

C

ome a cinematic adaptation was

less than its seminal, and the conven-
tional wisdom is not, but at least one recent, even

other. Although many readers loved the

scene of Mihalek in The Cider House Rules, the fisticuffs didn’t make

but when she was dropped from John Travolta’s Cross country was

the other hand, some readers of

Hannah’s Sheik and Melvin Berman’s
criticism of Hannah’s Sheik and

Berman’s screenwriting now.

Since the audience for a successful

film doesn’t the readability of even the

most popular book, directors have to
do what makes sense cinematically and

live with the consequences. Two-time

screenwriter Melvin Berman notes that

Scheber prefers his acting roles to A

Walk on the Water and the success

of Hannah’s Sheik should carry him for

Hurtner reviews ‘Everything is Illuminated’ and ‘Diva’

Published in World Jewish Digest (Sept 2005)

be decided which include eliminating

200 years worth of Talmudic shod history — the right ones.

The review of Scheber’s film is in the

2005 novel of the same name by Jonathan Safran Foer. ‘Everything is

Illuminated’ was an immediate best-

seller which won numerous prizes,

including the National Jewish Book

Award for Fiction. But buried within

the critical praise were some comments

about ‘grandiose scenes’ and scenes of

‘invaluable notice’, and by the time

Foer’s second novel, ‘Extremely Loud

and Incredibly Close’, came out a few

months ago, most critics had tuned

down their praise. John Updike’s very

kind and candid review for the

New Yorker captured the problem in

its concluding paragraph: ‘...it feels

more obvious, a few fewer messages, less

graphic apparent might be Foer’s

continuation on page 41.’
Can a cinematic adaptation ever best its source? The conventional wisdom is no, but at least two recent cases argue otherwise. Although many readers loved the character of “Melanie” in The Cider House Rules, the film’s many fans didn’t miss her when she was dropped from John Irving’s Oscar-winning screenplay. On the other hand, some readers of The Human Stain dismissed “Delphine Roux” as yet another one of Philip Roth’s tiresome shrews, so few complained about her greatly diminished role in Robert Benton’s screen version.

Since the audience for a successful film dwarfs the readership of even the most popular book, directors have to do what makes sense cinematically and live with the consequences. First-time screenwriter/director Liev Schreiber (best known for his acting roles in A Walk on the Moon and the recent remake of The Manchurian Candidate) should ready himself for outrage from the faithful when Everything is Illuminated is released this month, but his decisions—which include eliminating 200 years’ worth of Trachimbrod shtetl history—are the right ones.

The source of Schreiber’s film is the 2002 novel of the same name by Jonathan Safran Foer. Everything is Illuminated was an immediate best-seller which won numerous prizes, including the National Jewish Book Award for Fiction. But buried within the critical praise were some caveats about “grandiose targets” and overuse of “technical tricks,” and by the time Foer’s second novel, Extremely Loud and Incredibly Close, came out a few months ago, most critics had toned down their praise. John Updike’s very long and extremely kind review for the New Yorker captured the problem in its concluding paragraph: “…a little more silence, a few fewer messages, less graphic apparatus might let Foer’s excellent empathy, imagination, and good will resonate all the louder.” Bottom line? Foer’s novels read like too much of a good thing.

But Schreiber’s adaptation is just right. In the book, there are two main characters. The first is a young Jewish-American college student named “Jonathan Safran Foer.” The second is a Ukrainian college student named “Alexander Perchov.” These two characters are doppelgangers, meant to mirror each other so that the real Jonathan Safran Foer (the author) can speculate about what his own life might be like today if the Nazis had never occupied Ukraine.

But the Nazis did occupy Ukraine, and in both film and novel, the action begins when Jonathan arrives in Ukraine to search for Augustine, the woman who saved his grandfather Safran’s life and thereby enabled his escape to America. Alex’s father works for an Odessa-based travel agency called Heritage Touring, which specializes in trips such as these, and the two students meet when Alex is assigned the task of serving as Jonathan’s translator.

The book’s narrative takes place after the trip, in the form of a correspondence between Alex and Jonathan, both of whom have returned to their respective colleges. Alex sends Jonathan long letters that include chapters of a book he is writing about their trip. Jonathan sends Alex chapters of a book he is writing about Trachimbrod, the Ukrainian shtetl in which Safran was born and raised. Jonathan’s chapters are ersatz drivel, heavily imitating Isaac Bashevis Singer’s style of magical realism. The book’s most authentic voice belongs to Alex, and this is where Schreiber concentrates. (Readers must draw their own conclusions about the poor quality of the Trachimbrod book. Maybe Foer wants Jonathan to be a bad writer or at least a very young one. Schreiber doesn’t care. His Jonathan isn’t even a writer; he’s referred to as “the collector,” for reasons alluded to in the novel and beautifully embellished in the film.)

The film follows Alex and Jonathan as they travel around Ukraine together in the present tense in a Heritage Tours van with a prominent Jewish star driven by Alex’s grandfather (named Alex). Alex-the-Grandfather also insists on bringing his dog, an amorous female mutt called “Sammy Davis Junior Junior.” The point of a journey like this is never just the object of the search, although Alex and Jonathan do reach Trachimbrod and find a woman there whom they decide to call Augustine. This works because, in truth, there is no answer to the mystery of the Holocaust, which is why authors and filmmakers and historians will keep circling the terrain for years to
come. Although nothing is exactly illuminated, by the end many things can still be understood, and in Schreiber’s intelligent rendering, Alex wins our trust as a guide to the ineffable.

Coincidentally, a film called *Divan* will be released on DVD this month after a successful run around the Jewish film festival circuit as well as some commercial bookings (including a week at Chicago’s Landmark Century Theater). The narrator is Pearl Gluck, a Jewish-American woman on a quest of her own.

Pearl comes from a large Hasidic family based in the Borough Park neighborhood of Brooklyn. Unlike the more devout women in her family, however, Pearl finished college, began work on a doctorate in European Studies, and received a Fulbright Fellowship to collect the oral histories of Yiddish-speakers in Eastern Europe. But her father thinks she’s making all the wrong choices, so in an attempt to mollify him she makes a promise: while in Europe she will search for a precious heirloom, a divan that according to family legend served as the sleeping place for generations of prominent traveling rabbis.

Compared to Jonathan’s journey, Pearl’s adventures are straight-forward. She meets no Alex-like doppelgangers, just aging relatives who never left Hungary, somehow managing to survive both Hitler and Stalin. She drives through the countryside with an elderly uncle, all the while discussing the difference between current borders and the borders of memory. (Same old story: This used to be Poland, but now it’s Ukraine.) She finds the divan, but when she tries to bring it back to her father, relatives on distant continents make urgent phone calls to stop her. In the end, she finds a prize even more valuable than the one she went looking for, and she returns to Manhattan.

While this may sound heavy and serious, Pearl has a whimsical touch, and she counterpoints the travel scenes with the voices of Gen-Xers like herself who are also struggling to find a balance between the religious and the secular. Some of the friends Pearl interviews are noteworthy in their own right (like Basya Schechter of the band *Pharaoh’s Daughter*), some less so. But all are articulate and engaging. The glue is provided by a fabulous soundtrack by prolific composer Frank London, best known for his work with The Klezmatics.

Like Schreiber’s Jonathan, Pearl is a *zamler* (the Yiddish word for “collector”) who understands that seemingly ordinary objects can sometimes embody the sacred.

_Everything is Illuminated_ opens in Metro Chicago on 9/23/05 and in South Florida on 9/30/05. *Divan* will be available on DVD beginning 9/17/05.

Jan Lisa Huttner is the Managing Editor of Films for Two: The Online Guide for Busy Couples. A complete archive of her reviews for the World Jewish Digest can be found in the “Columns” section of www.films42.com.

**UPDATE:**

_Everything is Illuminated_ is now available on DVD from Amazon.

Eugene Hutz as “Alex” (left) & Elijah Wood as “Jonathan” (right) with Sammy Davis Junior Junior in their Heritage Tours van. Photo Credit: Neil Davidson/Warner Bros. Entertainment Inc.